2019 usTLD Stakeholder Council Annual Report

ANNUAL REPORT | usTLD STAKEHOLDER COUNCIL
YEAR: 2019

Q1 2019 Stakeholders Meeting
March 21, 2019 | 11:00am ET

Presented by Judy Song-Marshall
  I.   Welcome
       • Roll Call
       • Attendees:
           ⇒ Neustar: Judy Song-Marshall, Crystal Peterson
           ⇒ usTLD Stakeholder Council Members: Michele Neylon, Dustin Phillips, Shane Tews, Bryan Britt, Dave McClellan, Alex Deacon, Doug Robinson
  II. Old Business
       • Approval of December 2018 Minutes & Documents
           ⇒ December 2018 Minutes
           ⇒ 2018 Town Hall Summary
           ⇒ 4Q-2018 Quarter Report
       • All Documents were approved with no dissention
  III. SOI's: No new SOI's received
  IV. New Business
       • Thank you to Shane Tews; Appointment of Dustin Phillips as Chair
           ⇒ After serving on the Council for a couple of years, Shane Tews is stepping down. She has done so much for the usTLD Stakeholder Council - specifically as our champion with IGF USA and in our local community in DC and of course throughout the domain /internet community.
       • Welcome to the new usTLD Stakeholder Council Chairman: Dustin Phillips
           ⇒ Dustin has worked with ICANNWiki 4 years, where he has worked community-wide to build and promote it as an integral, but independent member of the larger ICANN community. In this role, he has served on both the Fellowship and Next-Gen selection committees. He is rounding out his tenure as Executive Director at the end of this month, but will continue to be engaged. Dustin is currently serving as the co-chair of the IGF-USA. In this role, last year, he embarked on a month long road trip growing the national presence of the IGF-USA and promoting .US along the way. (IGF-USA uses a .US domain name) Dustin is also the Executive Director of the Washington DC Chapter of the Internet Society, where he drives an agenda focused on promoting important discussions on Internet Governance and other issues facing the Internet globally and locally. Dustin also serves as Vice-President and Treasurer of the newly formed Diplo.US (also using a .US domain name), a US-focused initiative of the DiploFoundation.

Presented by Crystal Peterson

    V.   Policy Focus – our initiatives

- Locality Space Subcommittee
  ⇒ As background, Neustar began a usTLD Locality sub-committee in 2Q 2018 for the assessment, review and build of enhanced tools for usTLD Locality customers (both Delegated Managers and Registrants). We conducted three (3) meetings to kick-off the vision and scope of the sub-committee to be able to use as takeaways to input into our product roadmap and build enhanced tools for use by both Delegated Managers and Registrants in the usTLD Locality namespace.
  ⇒ Following the third meeting, Neustar has been designing specs and scheduling the Minimum Viable Product ("MVP") into its Product Roadmap. An MVP is expected to be available for initial testing and review by the sub-committee in late Q2-2019 timeframe. Timing has previously been stretched due to a resource management issue which has been corrected and further aligned with the usTLD 2019 goals.
  ⇒ As the Product team gets closer to its MVP, we look forward to re-initiating the sub-committee for testing and QA based on the initial feedback and questions provided.
- Security
  ⇒ A description of Neustar's security and threat mitigation tools for top-level domains is provided including the Registry Threat Mitigation Service (RTMS). RTMS proactively scans and receives feeds from trusted industry anti-abuse organizations to keep malicious actors out of the usTLD namespace. It identifies bad actors, facilitates investigations and allows Neustar to proactively take action against abusive activity, such as phishing, malware and botnets.
  ⇒ In addition to RTMS, Neustar is committed to continuing to develop our products and services to ensure that the usTLD is able to identify and address bad actors as quickly and efficiently as possible.
  ⇒ We are looking to the Council for independent expertise on this critical topic and would like to create a sub-committee around Security and the usTLD.
  ⇒ Comments: Mr. Michele Neylon noting that efforts should include/coincide with current Industry efforts and not cross purposes. Neustar assured that we currently have team members involved in Security efforts in the Industry and any efforts through the Council would be considered with the wider Industry in mind.

    VI.   Closing

- Next meeting time/date: June 13 – 11AM ET

Q2 2019 Stakeholders Meeting
June 13, 2019 | 11:00am ET

I. Welcome
II. Roll call and approval of March 2019 minutes
- usTLD Stakeholder Council: Dustin Phillips, Karen Rose, Bryan Britt, Susan Chalmers, Sam Sokol, Becky Burr, Bartlett Cleland, Doug Robinson, Tom Barrett
- Neustar: Crystal Peterson, Kristin Johnson, Kathy Neilsen, Fernando Espana, Janki Chopra
III. FH2019 Marketing Update
- Launched podcast advertising efforts in May with "Duct Tape Marketing" DJ read :60 second mid-roll spots. Duct Tape Marketing focuses on a small business audience with educational podcast series. Advertising included, tagged social posts, blog mentions, and logo in podcast notes.
- Political activation efforts with Campaign with .US marketing campaign targeted political and civic use for .US websites.
  ⇒ Showing highest levels of engagement and conversion, outside of paid search, of all our campaigns to date.
  ⇒ Continuing to run through July.
- Wrapped up year with Story of .US video campaign feature "Cesion.us" – High school web and app developers, recently awarded funding for a self-developed app project – Zuriel.
- Content driving website conversions and organic search to the about.us site. Total lift of 134% year over year.
IV. BH2019 Plans, goals and objectives
- Dustin introduced three main objectives:
  ⇒ Strengthen and promote work of Stakeholder Council – Increased communication and collaborating in-between quarterly calls.
    1. Highlight and promote work that Stakeholder Council is producing via blog post updates
  ⇒ Governance structure and policies for increased growth of .US. Identify gaps, identify opportunities, and produce action plan to address.
  ⇒ Identify high-visibility .US use-cases and produce blog features to promote use and awareness of .US civic organizations.
    1. First interview article with digitalequity.us - Posted in June
    2. Second article on IGF USA – Promote upcoming conference in July
    3. Diplo.us – Focuses on educational courses for digital, science and technical diplomacy
V. Policy & Security Updates
- Neustar participated in FDA's online Opioid Summit in April 2019.
  ⇒ Objective to tackle the sale of online opioids
  ⇒ Participated in panel to discuss industry responsibility and opportunities to better raise visibility and prevent online opioid sales.

      ⇒   Case study - Scan of .US namespace to identify and takedown sites found to be abusing domain for sale of opioids. Identified and removed 6 different sites.

      ⇒   Neustar continuing to evaluate policies around usage to ensure amendments are made as needed.

- Security sub-committee to identify, action and provide recommendations to reduce domain abuse in .US namespace.
  - ⇒ Next steps – Dustin reaching out to Council to form committee.
  - ⇒ Doug Robinson talks to reasons to address this now:
    1. Election security top-of-mind for current environment and is an immediate concern. Concerns of misdirection and misrepresentation of domains to mimic election boards, election sites, etc. to deliberately confuse voters. Mandates at the local level to move sites to .gov. Conversations happening at State and City level on best ways to protect voters for upcoming election period.
    2. Karen asks Susan if there are any intergovernmental efforts or task force from the NTIA to address election fraud. Susan not familiar with an ongoing dialogue related to elections however is currently addressing the same concerns related to upcoming Census.

VI.   Upcoming IGF USA participation
- Third sponsorship in IGF USA
- Dustin discusses presence.
  - ⇒ Date is July 25, 2019
  - ⇒ .US official coffee break sponsor with coffee cups, signage and palm cards distributed.
  - ⇒ Conference to discuss: National privacy framework discussion, "Techlash" – The backlash against big tech platforms, competition, cybersecurity, digital inclusion, 5G, artificial intelligence
  - ⇒ Day 0 Youth Event - Half-day event prior to IGF USA with .US participation. Agenda driven by youth organizers.

VII.   Locality sub-committee
- MVP on track for end of June.
- Brian delegated manager for committee and looking to add members as well as registrants.
  - ⇒ Brian has contractual concerns to be addressed in separate follow-up.

VIII.   Proposed meeting time/date for Town Hall in October
- Crystal proposes dates for potential meeting. ICANN happening in November as well as end of year holidays so need to lock down an October date to promote during the July IGF sponsorship.

IX.   Closing
- Next meeting scheduled for 19 September 2019, 11am EDT

Q2 2019 Locality Tool Sub-Committee
June 25, 2019

View the Presentation Update

Q3 2019 Stakeholders Meeting
September 19, 2019 | 11:00am ET

    I.   Welcome
   II.   Roll call and approval of June 2019 minutes
- usTLD Stakeholder Council: Dustin Phillips, Karen Rose, Bryan Britt, William Bumpas, Becky Burr, Doug Robinson, Tom Barrett
- Neustar: Crystal Peterson, Kristin Johnson, Fernando Espana, Janki Chopra

  III.   Q3-2019 Marketing Update
- Google launches domain marketing program in September 2019. .US coordinated efforts include custom .US landing page and dedicated SEM paid advertising funds for .US promotion and registration.
- .US Sponsorship of 20th Anniversary events, publications and digital efforts
    - ⟹ Branded give-aways to include in commemorative gift bags distributed throughout the year – We produced .US branded multi-use charging cables.
- IGF Annual Forum took place on July, 25, 2019. .US was official coffee break sponsor for the event. Sponsorship included:
    - ⟹ .US flyers distributed at Internet Policy Table
    - ⟹ Promotion of .US Town Hall registrations
    - ⟹ .US logo and branding throughout the event
- Content foundational effort to drive SEO and social strategy. Five new articles posted in Q3 with search showing a 27% increase in organic traffic.
- Social efforts ongoing throughout the year are driving high engagement and conversion traffic. Optimizations in Q3 with increased efforts for evergreen promotion.

  IV.   Policy & Security Updates
- Dustin discussed Security sub-committee meeting date and time.
    - ⟹ Date confirmed for September 27, 2019
    - ⟹ Additional members requesting participation:
        1. Becky Burr
        2. William Bumpas

   V.   usTLD Locality Space Updates
- Locality Management - Crystal provides update on timeline and changes. Working on incorporating feedback from Brian.
    - ⟹ Platform development based on feedback from registrants trying to get in touch with their delegated manager. Requesting a log-in platform to access domain data.
    - ⟹ Tool will be available to delegated managers and their customers.

- DNS Management Tool
  ⇒ Will function as a one stop shop for domain managers and delegated managers to manage DNS records.
  ⇒ Looking into options for SSL certificate support specific for locality space.
    1. Brian explains some of the difficulties for SSL in locality space and why support is needed.
    2. Tom Barrett asks about SSL approach and domain validated free SSL certs. How does this ties into WHOIS?
       a. Crystal explains second level and third level zone challenges.
    3. Brian discuss benefits of the tool and how it will be used by managers.

VI. Review Town Hall Date/Time and Outreach efforts
- Kristin discusses promotion plan and asks for Stakeholder support in outreach and promotion. Will make social assets and promo materials available.
- Shared high-level agenda and opened up to Stakeholder for additional request or topics to address – nothing additional suggested.

VII. Closing
- Becky shares news on abuse media coverage on registries from GAC https://gac.icann.org/contentMigrated/gac-statement-on-dns-abuse and http://domainincite.com/author/piscitellochapin

Q3 2019 Security Sub-Committee Meeting
September 27, 2019

Attendees	**Apologies**
Dustin Loup	Becky Burr
Sam Sokol	
Doug Robinson	
Karen Rose	
Alex Deacon	
Tom Barrett	
Bartlett Cleland	
William Bumpas	
Crystal Peterson	

Meeting Notes
In the first meeting of the usTLD Security Subcommittee, the discussion focused on the potential scope, identifying tracks of focus, discussing possible deliverables and identifying the next steps.

The meeting began with a brief overview of current policies and the current state of abuse and reputation. In order to best map a path forward, it was recommended that we gather data to properly inform our discussion.

In discussion about potential deliverables, it was suggested the we don't operate under the assumption that we will produce recommended changes. This suggestion was made in response to discussion about producing a case study/report that could contribute to the broader ccTLD community.

Participants in the call also suggested that we should be focusing on DNS security technologies, including but not limited to DNSSEC, SSL/TLS, and DMARC. The group discussed how to best approach this from a policy perspective. The possibility of requiring adoption was discussed, but there was greater support for producing recommended best practices. No decisions were made.

The primary outcome of the initial meeting was identifying two tracks of review that the Subcommittee will undertake to make possible recommendations that contribute to trust in .US space.

Scope and Tracks of Subcommittee
DNS Abuse
- Commonly Accepted forms of DNS Abuse within the industry
    - Malware
    - Phishing
    - Botnet C&C
    - Spam
- Current usTLD policy outlines additional restrictions, both security and content related
- The Subcommittee will need to determine how broad to focus its review of current policies
    - In this discussion, caution was encourage when considering removing protections currently in place.
- If the need for recommendations is agreed upon, the group will develop language for policy update recommendations
- The review and recommendations will be informed by available data on abuse.

DNS Security
- The Subcommittee expressed interest in determining how best to support and encourage a trusted .US space with the implementation of secure protocols by registrants at the second level and in the locality space. The discussion highlighted SSL/TLS, DNSSEC and DMARC.

- The Subcommittee will need to determine what type of recommendations to produce. There was debate between policies and best practices. While no decisions were made, there was greater support for best practices.

- The directives for boards of elections to use either a .gov or .us was highlighted and emphasized the importance of continuing to make .us a space that is trusted, both in this context and in a wider sense. These directives also include a requirement for the use of TLS and DMARC.

- The modernization of the locality space was highlighted as a boost to the capability for using these fore mentioned technologies.

Deliverables
Baseline
- Review and analyze current policies in the context of current state of .us, as well as current industry and threat environments
- Determine if any updates are needed
- Produce a report to Neustar outlining our conclusions

Potential
- If the subcommittee decides policy updates are needed, the group will produce a set of policy recommendations
- For DNS security technology (including but not limited to SSL/TLS, DNSSEC, DMARC) deciding how to best ensure that the .US space maximizes trust and producing recommendations accordingly
- Producing a public report based on the recommendations of the usTLD Security Subcommittee that contributes to the broader ccTLD community

Next Steps
- Request the following information from Neustar
    - Data on DNS abuse on the .US TLD from Spamhaus and/or any other vendors providing data
    - Data on use of the .US TLD by governments, including agencies, elections boards, etc.
    - Data on DNSSEC Deployment in .US space
- Schedule next meeting to review data and develop work plan for the two tracks: DNS Abuse / Acceptable Uses and DNS Security / Adoption of secure technologies at the second level
- Schedule monthly calls after receiving the data we need

Q4 2019 Stakeholders Meeting
December 12, 2019 | 11:00am ET

I. Welcome
II. Roll call and approval of September 2019 minutes
- usTLD Stakeholder Council: Dustin Loup, Karen Rose, William Bumpas, Becky Burr, Tom Barrett, Alex Deacon, Bartlett Cleland, Laureen Kapin
- Neustar: Crystal Peterson, Kristin Johnson, Donna Austin, Fernando Espana, Melissa Cohen, Kathy Nielsen
- Approval of September minutes: Dustin moves to approve, Tom seconds the motion. No one objects.
III. Q4-2019 Marketing Update
- Veterans Campaign - Campaign looks to connect with military members as the online home of veteran-owned businesses.
    ⇒ Landing page, new ads and podcast advertising drove 170% increase in web traffic.

- Content - Efforts to support SEO and website continue with four new articles added in Q4 including a use-case feature on "Diplo.US," and a Vet-repreneur feature to complement the Veteran's campaign.
  ⇒ Alex provided brewstat.us use-case example for future case-study use
- Evergreen – Ongoing small business outreach on top performing platforms including Facebook, Instagram and Paid Search.
- 2020 Highlights
  ⇒ Expand on micro-audience community outreach including blogging community and creative/artist community dedicated campaigns.
  ⇒ Focus on digital literacy going into 2020 and developing thought leadership content pieces.
  ⇒ Wedding campaign is relaunching in Q1 2020.

IV. Policy & Security Updates
- ICANN Montreal Recap
  ⇒ Donna provides recap on annual meeting.
  ⇒ Announcement of Maarten Botterman replaces Cherine Chalaby as Chair of ICANN Board along with two new board members added:
    1. Mandla Msimang
    2. Ihab Osman
    3. Becky states Mandla and Ihab attended the Board workshop in Los Angeles in September
  ⇒ DNS Abuse and consumer safeguards big focus at Montreal.
    1. Live discussion on positions
    2. Best practices on response to DNS Abuse
    3. Examples of ccTLDs with good practices in use
    4. Action item: Better inform community of actions taken to mitigate abuse
    5. From Laureen Kapin (FTC): The discussions in Montreal were very constructive. We appreciated the opportunity to have these exchanges. I think the community would welcome more information on the existing good work already being done by registries (and registrars) to deal with DNS Abuse.
  ⇒ Geographic names in new TLD program
    1. Geographic names work track – delivers final recommendations to subsequent procedures PDP working group.
- Subcommittees
  ⇒ Security – Dustin provides updates.
    1. One meeting this year with second planned for January 2020.
    2. Two tracks:
        a. DNS Abuse
        b. Implementation and adoption of secure protocols

3. Report and review underway of current .US security policies for internal stakeholders.
4. Possible external report effort to contribute to the ccTLD community.
   a. Laureen Kapin: The ccTLDs discussed were .DK and .EU. The X community discussion is also available via ICANN website.
5. Next steps – Dustin to schedule January meeting to discuss report findings.

⇒ Locality – Crystal delivers updates.
1. Effort kicked off end of 2018 and last couple months have seen new progress on development.
2. Testing underway of tool interface
3. Goal: Delegated managers to manage their namespaces and for registrants to log in and manage their spaces all in one tool.

V. 2020 Plans
- 2020 Meeting schedule
  ⇒ Review and approval of proposed meetings:
  1. Q1 - March 19, 2020 at 11:00 am Eastern Time
  2. Q2 - June 11, 2020 at 11:00 am Eastern Time
  3. Q3 - September 17, 2020 at 11:00 am Eastern Time
  4. TOWN HALL - November 5, 2020 at 11:00 am Eastern Time
  5. Q4 -December 10, 2020 at 11:00 am Eastern Time
  ⇒ November 5 – Overlaps with IGF 11/2-11/6
  1. Propose 11/12
  ⇒ Alex Deacon notes that Thursday meetings will be a challenge for those following/participating in the ICANN EPDP calls.
  1. Becky Burr confirms when we hit daylight savings time, the calls are 10-12
  2. Propose moving meetings to noon.
  ⇒ Updated schedule:
  1. Q1 - March 19, 2020 at 12:00 am Eastern Time
  2. Q2 - June 11, 2020 at 12:00 am Eastern Time
  3. Q3 - September 17, 2020 at 12:00 am Eastern Time
  4. TOWN HALL - November 12, 2020 at 12:00 am Eastern Time
  5. Q4 -December 10, 2020 at 12:00 am Eastern Time
- Member updates
  ⇒ James Bladel stepping down from committee and Ray King from Porkbun will be joining in 2020.
  ⇒ Karen Rose stepping down as Vice Chair but will remain on the Stakeholder council.
  1. Will have a proposal for replacement to present at Q1 March 2020 meeting.

VI. Closing